

Reporting Category	Scoring Criteria	
Row A Thesis (0-1 points) 4.B	0 points For any of the following: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> There is no defensible thesis. The intended thesis only restates the prompt. The intended thesis provides a summary of the issue with no apparent or coherent claim. There is a thesis, but it does not respond to the prompt. 	1 point Responds to the prompt with a thesis that presents a defensible position.
	Decision Rules and Scoring Notes	
	Responses that do not earn this point: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Only restate the prompt. Do not take a position, or the position must be inferred or is vague. Equivocate or summarize other’s arguments but not the student’s (e.g., some people say it’s good, some people say it’s bad). State an obvious fact rather than making a claim that requires a defense. 	Responses that earn this point: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Respond to the prompt by developing a position on the most important factors that should be considered when deciding whether to establish a wind farm, rather than restate or rephrase the prompt. Clearly takes a position rather than just stating that there are pros/cons.
	Examples that do not earn this point: Restate the prompt <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>“The establishment of large-scale wind farms are often the subject of controversy.”</i> Address the topic of the prompt, but do not take a position <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>“The use of wind turbines for power has many benefits and also many potential disadvantages. All of these things should be considered when establishing a wind farm.” [Sample H]</i> Present a thesis that does not respond to the prompt <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>“Today, there are over 800 wind turbines in America. But, is this source of energy a good way to go? Wind turbines tend to have many harmful affects, and do more harm than good.” [Sample HH]</i> 	Examples that earn this point: Present a defensible position that responds to the prompt <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <i>“The most important factors that an individual or agency should consider when deciding whether to establish a wind farm are the noise impacts, the alteration of landscapes, and the cost of the wind farms.” [Sample L]</i> <i>“As wind farms continue to proliferate all across the United States, the individuals and agencies establishing and supporting them ought to carefully ponder wind farms’ effects on local national economies and human comfort/quality of life as their most important considerations.” [Sample LL]</i> <i>“Agencies looking to establish wind farms should consider the geographic location of their potential wind farm and its vicinity to resident communities, in order to avoid stirring up more controversy in society’s debate on how to settle an increasingly demanding appetite for energy.” [Sample A]</i>
	Additional Notes: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> The thesis may be more than one sentence, provided the sentences are in close proximity. The thesis may be anywhere within the response. For a thesis to be defensible, the sources must include at least minimal evidence that <i>could</i> be used to support that thesis; however, the student need not cite that evidence to earn the thesis point. The thesis <i>may</i> establish a line of reasoning that structures the essay, but it needn’t do so to earn the thesis point. A thesis that meets the criteria can be awarded the point whether or not the rest of the response successfully supports that line of reasoning. 	

Reporting Category	Scoring Criteria				
Row B Evidence AND Commentary (0-4 points) <div>2.A</div> <div>4.A</div> <div>6.A</div> <div>6.B</div> <div>6.C</div>	0 points Simply restates thesis (if present), repeats provided information, or references fewer than two of the provided sources.	1 point EVIDENCE: Provides evidence from or references at least two of the provided sources. AND COMMENTARY: Summarizes the evidence but does not explain how the evidence supports the student's argument.	2 points EVIDENCE: Provides evidence from or references at least three of the provided sources. AND COMMENTARY: Explains how some of the evidence relates to the student's argument, but no line of reasoning is established, or the line of reasoning is faulty.	3 points EVIDENCE: Provides specific evidence from at least three of the provided sources to support all claims in a line of reasoning. AND COMMENTARY: Explains how some of the evidence supports a line of reasoning.	4 points EVIDENCE: Provides specific evidence from at least three of the provided sources to support all claims in a line of reasoning. AND COMMENTARY: Consistently explains how the evidence supports a line of reasoning.
	Decision Rules and Scoring Notes				
	Typical responses that earn 0 points: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Are incoherent or do not address the prompt. May be just opinion with no textual references or references that are irrelevant. 	Typical responses that earn 1 point: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Tend to focus on summary or description of sources rather than specific details. [Sample G] 	Typical responses that earn 2 points: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Consist of a mix of specific evidence and broad generalities. May contain some simplistic, inaccurate, or repetitive explanations that don't strengthen the argument. [Sample HH] May make one point well, but either do not make multiple supporting claims or do not adequately support more than one claim. Do not explain the connections or progression between the student's claims, so a line of reasoning is not clearly established. [Sample E] 	Typical responses that earn 3 points: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Uniformly offer evidence to support claims. Focus on the importance of specific words and details from the sources to build an argument. Organize an argument as a line of reasoning composed of multiple supporting claims. [Sample II] Commentary may fail to integrate some evidence or fail to support a key claim. [Sample L] 	Typical responses that earn 4 points: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Uniformly offer evidence to support claims. [Sample A] Focus on the importance of specific words and details from the sources to build an argument. [Sample TT] Organize and support an argument as a line of reasoning composed of multiple supporting claims, each with adequate evidence that is clearly explained. [Sample LL]
Additional Notes: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Writing that suffers from grammatical and/or mechanical errors that interfere with communication cannot earn the fourth point in this row. 					

Reporting Category	Scoring Criteria	
Row C Sophistication (0-1 points) 2.A 4.C 6.B 8.A 8.B 8.C	0 points Does not meet the criteria for one point.	1 point Demonstrates sophistication of thought and/or develops a complex understanding of the rhetorical situation.
	Decision Rules and Scoring Notes	
	Responses that do not earn this point: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> Attempt to contextualize their argument, but such attempts consist predominantly of sweeping generalizations (“<i>In a world where...</i>” OR “<i>Since the beginning of time...</i>”). Only hint at or suggest other arguments (“<i>While some may argue that...</i>” OR “<i>Some people say...</i>”). Use complicated or complex sentences or language that are ineffective because they do not enhance the argument. 	Responses that earn this point may demonstrate sophistication of thought and/or a complex understanding of the rhetorical situation by doing any of the following: <ol style="list-style-type: none"> Crafting a nuanced argument by consistently identifying and exploring complexities or tensions across the sources. [Sample LL] Articulating the implications or limitations of an argument (either the student’s argument or arguments conveyed in the sources) by situating it within a broader context. [Sample LL] [Sample A] [Sample II] Making effective rhetorical choices that consistently strengthen the force and impact of the student’s argument throughout the response. [Sample LL] Employing a style that is consistently vivid and persuasive. [Sample LL] [Sample A]
	Additional Notes: <ul style="list-style-type: none"> This point should be awarded only if the sophistication of thought or complex understanding is part of the student’s argument, not merely a phrase or reference. 	